Ministerial Code Complaint, Friends of the Earth Scotland

Dear John Swinney MSP,

Breaches of ministerial code regarding SSE and Equinor's application for new gas-fired power station at Peterhead, Aberdeenshire

This is a complaint regarding breaches of the Scottish Ministerial Code (2023 edition - 'the Ministerial Code').¹

It is based on a review of monthly "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts" reports and the Scottish Parliament Lobbying Register³ conducted using data available as of 28th March 2024.

This complaint arises from the conduct of several Ministers of the Scottish Government in relation to the application made by SSE and Equinor ('the developers') under Section 36 of the Electricity Act 1989 for consent to build a gas-fired power station and carbon capture plant at Peterhead ('the Peterhead application').

The Peterhead application was received by the Scottish Ministers on 18th February 2022 and is under consideration by the Energy Consents Unit (reference: ECU00003433).

This complaint alleges that:

- A. Actions by individual Ministers have prejudiced the energy consents process. (10 breaches)
- B. The former First Minister made public statements in support of the Peterhead gas power plant application. (1 breach)
- C. Meetings between the Scottish Ministers and the developers were not properly recorded by the Scottish Government. (16 breaches)
- D. Ministers have met repeatedly with the developers to discuss the Peterhead gas plant application, but they have refused to do so with objectors. (1 breach)

This represents 28 separate breaches of the Ministerial Code.

https://www.gov.scot/collections/ministerial-engagements-travel-and-gifts/

1

¹ 2023 Edition of the Scottish Government Ministerial Code, https://www.gov.scot/publications/scottish-ministerial-code-2023-edition/

² Scottish Government, 'Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts':

³ https://www.lobbying.scot/

A & B. Actions taken by Ministers including the First Minister which have caused prejudice to the energy consents process

Section 8 of the Ministerial Code is titled "Ministers' Engagement on Planning Matters, including the Granting of Energy Consents".

The Peterhead application is an application for an energy consent - section 8 of the Ministerial Code is directly relevant to the treatment of the Peterhead application by Scottish Ministers.

Paragraph 8.1 explains that the general principle of Section 8 of the Ministerial Code is that Ministers "should take particular care to avoid conflicts of interest when dealing with planning matters, including the granting of energy consents".

Paragraph 8.3 states that:

8.3 To help ensure the fairness and transparency of the planning system, the Planning Minister or any other Minister involved in the planning decision, must do nothing which might be seen as prejudicial to that process, particularly in advance of the decision being taken...

Paragraphs 8.9 and 8.10 contain further requirements for the First Minister vis-à-vis the planning process, including that:

8.9...The First Minister must be seen to do nothing that could be perceived as prejudicial to the planning process...

8.10 The First Minister should avoid making any public statement about the merits of a planning application (even in their capacity as local MSP) that might be seen to put the Planning Minister under pressure when making a decision about a planning matter...

Ministers have breached paragraphs 8.3 and 8.9 of the Ministerial Code on 10 occasions by providing the developers with vocal support for the Peterhead application and by meeting with developers without making clear that the planning process is independent and not impacted by their discussions (i-x below).

The First Minister has also breached paragraph 8.10 on one occasion by issuing a public statement in support of the development (viii).

The individual breaches were as follows:

(i) 26th April 2022 at a meeting between **Equinor** and Nicola Sturgeon MSP, First Minister. The First Minister was briefed by civil servants to say that she welcomed "Equinor's continued investment in Scotland" and that "the Peterhead site is ideally placed for carbon capture technology, with access to essential CO2 transport and storage infrastructure being developed through the Acorn Project... Equinor and SSE Thermal's proposed CCS Power Station formed part of the Acorn Cluster bid in the UK Cluster Sequencing process." This is a specific offer of support for the Peterhead gas power station, and is therefore prejudicial to the planning process. The records

- state that the First Minister "recognised shared goals with Equinor." Additionally, there is no mention in the meeting records that the development was under a live planning application.⁴
- (ii) 10th May 2022 at a meeting between **Equinor** and Richard Lochhead MSP, Minister for Just Transition Employment and Fair Work, the Minister was briefed by civil servants to welcome "Equinor's continued investment in Scotland", referencing specifically that "in March 2022, SSE Thermal and Equinor submitted a planning application to the Scottish Ministers for a proposed 910MW Peterhead Carbon Capture Power Station project. This is now being considered by the Energy Consents Unit, with a determination likely next year." There is no mention of any sensitivities regarding the development being a live planning application.⁵
- (iii) 16th May 2022 Michael Matheson MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Net Zero and Energy, provided a quote for a press release issued by **SSE**. The press release begins: "a planned new low-carbon power station at SSE Thermal's Peterhead site in Aberdeenshire could generate significant benefits to the Scottish and UK economies over its lifetime." Matheson is quoted as follows: "The innovative Peterhead CCGT Power Station is a fantastic example of how Scotland's energy sector can make the transition to net zero and as this study demonstrates benefit the Scottish economy, providing employment and a just transition for our workforces… It shows just how important it is to invest now in carbon capture technology."⁶
- (iv) 30th May 2022 at a dinner for investors organised by Ivan McKee MSP, Minister for Business Trade Tourism and Enterprise and attended by David Cairns of **Equinor**, the Minister was briefed by civil servants as follows. "Peterhead Carbon Capture Power Station: This is being developed by SSE Thermal and Equinor. The proposed plant could become one of the UK's first power stations equipped with a carbon capture plant to remove CO2 from its emissions and would connect into the Scottish Cluster's CO2 transport and storage infrastructure, which underpins plans to deliver one of the UK's first low-carbon industrial clusters" and that the Minister should "offer your support in any challenges faced by the organisation." There is no mention that the development was a live planning application.
- (v) 16th June 2022 a video conference took place between Michael Matheson MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Net Zero Energy and Transport, and **Equinor** responding to a letter from David Cairns, Equinor, in which he was "thanking you for your support on a media release relating to Peterhead Carbon Capture Power Station". The Minister was briefed by civil servants that "SSE Thermal and Equinor unveiled plans to jointly develop a new low-carbon power station at Peterhead", that "the Peterhead site is ideally placed for carbon capture and storage technology...", that the Scottish Government "supports the development of CCUS" and that "The Scottish Government is a strong advocate for the development of Carbon Capture Utilisation

⁴ Scottish Government response to FOI request, 'FOI 1, part 1', p.1: https://www.whatdotheyknow.com/request/equnior and sse meetings with th/response/2570032/attach/3/EiR %20202400396587%20Equinor%20meetings.pdf?cookie passthrough=1

⁵ Scottish Government response to FOI request, 'FOI 1, part 1' (link above), p.14

⁶ SSE website, copy available on request from FoES if required: https://www.sse.com/news-and-views/2022/05/peterhead-carbon-capture-project-to-contribute-660-million-to-scottish-economy/

⁷ Scottish Government response to FOI request, 'FOI 1, part 1' (link above), p.37

and Storage (CCUS). We believe Scotland is uniquely positioned to deploy this technology on an industrial scale...", emphasising the interconnected nature of the Peterhead proposal with other Scottish Government supported initiatives. There is no mention that the development was a live planning application.⁸

- (vi) 10th August 2022 at a video conference between **Equinor** and Nicola Sturgeon MSP, First Minister. The First Minister was briefed by civil servants that Equinor were "collaborating with SSE Thermal to develop Peterhead Carbon Capture Power Station which is expected to start operations by 2027" and that the "Scottish Government have previously welcomed... Equinor's partnership with SSE to produce power with carbon capture and storage in Peterhead". There is no mention that the development was a live planning application.⁹
- (vii) 2nd May 2023 at a video conference between three representatives of **Equinor** including the CEO and Humza Yousaf MSP, First Minister. The First Minister was briefed by civil servants that Equinor were "collaborating with SSE Thermal to develop Peterhead Carbon Capture Power Station which is expected to start operations by 2027". There is no mention that the development was a live planning application.¹⁰
- (viii) 18th July 2023 at a visit to the existing Peterhead gas power station which, according to an email from Tom Thomson, Special Advisor to the First Minister, dated 14th July 2023, had the express purpose of discussing "SSE proposal for [sic] CCS energy plant". First Minister Humza Yousaf MSP invited photographers to the event and was pictured wearing an SSE jacket. He appeared on a promotional video for SSE saying "what I've been really impressed with is their plans for the future". The Scottish Government tweeted about the event that "On a visit to SSE Thermal Peterhead Power Station, the FM said the scheme is vital to Scotland's transition to clean energy." A Scottish Government press release included a statement from SSE and the First Minister about the closely associated Acorn CCS project. Scottish Government records associated with the meeting make no mention that the development was a live planning application.

⁸ Scottish Government response to FOI request, 'FOI 1, part 1' (link above), p.41-42

⁹ Scottish Government response to FOI request, 'FOI 1, part 1' (link above), p.56

¹⁰ Scottish Government response to FOI request, 'FOI 1, part 1' (link above), p.76

¹¹ Scottish Government response to FOI request, 'Peterhead Combined Cycle Gas Turbine (CCGT) power station development: EIR release', p.7:

 $[\]frac{https://www.gov.scot/binaries/content/documents/govscot/publications/foi-eir-release/2024/03/foi-202300378265/documents/eir-202300378265---information-released---annex-b/eir-202300378265---information-released---annex-b/govscot%3Adocument/EIR%2B202300378265%2B-%2BInformation%2BReleased%2B-%2BAnnex%2BB.pdf$

¹² SSE, 'Scotland's First Minister Visits SSE Thermal Peterhead Power Station': https://www.sse.com/news-and-views/2023/07/scotland-s-first-minister-visits-sse-thermal-s-peterhead-power-station/

¹³ Twitter / x.com, 18th July 2023: https://twitter.com/scotgov/status/1681328435979796480

¹⁴ Scottish Government website, copy available on request from FoES if required: https://www.gov.scot/news/uk-government-urged-to-end-carbon-capture-scheme-delays/

¹⁵ For the avoidance of doubt, the comments and actions of the First Minister which are described in this paragraph were contrary to paragraphs 8.3, 8.9 and 8.10 of the Ministerial Code. With respect to paragraph 8.3, the First Minister's comments and actions have prejudiced the energy consents process by compromising his impartiality regarding the Peterhead application. The First Minister's public statements in support of the Peterhead application directly contravene the requirements of paragraph 8.10 of the Ministerial Code under which the First Minister should avoid making any statement on the merits of a planning application.

- (ix) 8th November 2023 at a meeting between **Equinor** and Humza Yousaf MSP, First Minister. The First Minister was briefed by civil servants that "Equinor is collaborating with SSE Thermal to develop the proposed 910 MW Peterhead Carbon Capture Power Station, which could be operational as early as 2027." A list of "sensitivities" is provided but there is no mention that the development was a live planning application. ¹⁶
- (x) 1st February 2024 Neil Gray MSP, Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy, spoke and presented an award at an event whose lead sponsor was the "**Peterhead Carbon Capture Power station**". It is highly likely that representatives of the developers were present and the Scottish Government have not provided evidence to show that measures were taken to ensure the planning process was unaffected. 18

¹⁶ Scottish Government response to FOI request, 'FOI 1, part 1 (link above)', p.88 and p.94

¹⁷ Scottish Business News website: https://scottishbusinessnews.net/decarbscotland-conference-2024-envisions-a-future-where-mass-carbon-capture-is-the-norm/

¹⁸ See table above: 'Meetings not recorded by the Scottish Government'

C. Meetings not recorded by the Scottish Government

Paragraph 4.23 of the 2023 Ministerial Code states that "a private secretary or official should be present for all discussions relating to government business. Private offices should arrange for the basic facts of formal meetings between Ministers and outside interest groups to be recorded..." and (Paragraph 4.24) that "if Ministers meet external organisations or individuals and find themselves discussing official business without an official present... any significant content should be passed back to their Private Offices... who should arrange for the basic facts of such meetings to be recorded..."

Ministers have breached the Ministerial Code by meeting with the developers without keeping proper records.

On the following 16 occasions the Lobbying Register shows that meetings took place between the developers and Scottish Ministers, but Scottish Government records are missing or not available.

All 16 incidents are missing from the published list of *Ministerial engagements*, *travel and gifts*. ¹⁹ Three of these incidents involve discussion of national energy policy but no records were held as they were erroneously reported as constituency business and on a further two incidents the Scottish Government said no records were kept for unknown reasons.

Date	Minister	Company and lobbyists	Location	Nature of breach	Sources ²⁰
18/03/2022	John Swinney MSP (Cabinet Secretary for Finance and the Economy, Cabinet Secretary for Covid Recovery, Deputy First Minister)	SSE: Gregor Alexander, Niall Murphy	Inveralmond House 200 Dunkeld Road Perth	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts", FOI response states "these were held in respective capacities as Members of the Scottish Parliament" however the Lobbying Register states that SSE's "project plans in Scotland." were discussed	Lobbying Register; Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Freedom of Information request
30/05/2022	Ivan McKee MSP (Minister for Business, Trade, Tourism and Enterprise)	Equinor: David Cairns	Dakota Hotel Glasgow 179 West Regent Street Glasgow	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts", details of meeting were published in response to an FOI request	Lobbying Register; Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Freedom of Information request

_

¹⁹ Scottish Government, 'Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts', link above

²⁰ Sources are detailed in the accompanying spreadsheet, tab 2

07/10/2022	Richard Lochhead MSP (Minister for Just Transition, Employment and Fair Work)	SSE: Kate Wallace Lockhart	SNP Party Conference 2022, The Event Complex Aberdeen	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts", FOI response states "these were held in respective capacities as Members of the Scottish Parliament" however Lobbying Register lists the event with Mr Lochhead in his Ministerial position.	Lobbying Register; Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Freedom of Information request
16/12/2022	Angus Robertson MSP (Cabinet Secretary for the Constitution, External Affairs and Culture)	SSE: Gregor Alexander, Gordon Bell, Niall Murphy	7 Castle Street Edinburgh	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts", FOI response states "these were held in respective capacities as Members of the Scottish Parliament" however Lobbying Register records discussions on SSE plans to invest in Scotland.	Lobbying Register; Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Freedom of Information request
16/03/2023	Richard Lochhead MSP (Minister for Just Transition, Employment and Fair Work)	SSE: Niall Murphy	CMSLLP, Saltire Court, Edinburgh	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts", details of meeting were published in response to an FOI request	Lobbying Register; Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Freedom of Information request
13/04/2023	Richard Lochhead MSP (Minister for Small Business, Innovation, Tourism and Trade)	SSE: Kirstanne Land, Cath Swan	Ugie Hotel	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts"	Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Lobbying Register
08/06/2023	Maree Todd MSP (Minister for Social Care, Mental Wellbeing and Sport)	SSE: Greg Clarke, Kirstanne Land, Rebecca Gay	Scottish Parliament, Garden Lobby	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts"	Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Lobbying Register
09/06/2023	Mairi Gougeon MSP (Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands)	SSE: Christianna Logan, Tony Scott, Calum Grant, Kirstanne Land	Dickson Hall, Laurencekirk	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts"	Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Lobbying Register

10/0//0000	Maria	COD N. 11	g	3.6	Maria
12/06/2023	Mairi Gougeon MSP (Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands)	SSE: Niall Murphy	Seagreen Offshore Wind Farm	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts"	Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Lobbying Register
19/06/2023	Mairi Gougeon MSP (Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands)	SSE: Kirstanne Land, Calum Grant, Louise Anderson	140 Castle Street, Forgar	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts"	Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Lobbying Register
26/06/2023	Màiri McAllan MSP (Wellbeing Economy, Net Zero and Energy)	SSE: Niall Murphy, Morven Smith, Stuart Hood	Healthy Valleys, Lanark	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts"	Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Lobbying Register
15/07/2023	Emma Roddick MSP (Minister for Equalities, Migration and Refugees)	SSE: Christianna Logan, Kirstanne Land, David Boyland	Bught Park Pitches, Inverness	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts"	Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Lobbying Register
20/07/2023	Neil Gray MSP (Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy Fair Work and Energy)	SSE: Heather Donald, Jamie Maxton, Corinna Scholes	Viking Wind Farm, Shetland	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts"	Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Lobbying Register
07/09/2023	Neil Gray MSP (Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing economy, Fair Work and Energy)	SSE: Ben Walker	Royal Botanic Garden, Edinburgh	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts"	Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Lobbying Register
15/09/2023	Gillian Martin MSP (Minister for Energy)	SSE: Greg Clarke, Kirstanne Land	Colpy Business Park, Oldmeldrum	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts", FOI response states "we have no records of meetings having taken place"	Lobbying Register; Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts; Freedom of Information request
01/02/2024	Neil Gray MSP (Cabinet Secretary for Wellbeing Economy, Fair Work and Energy)	Peterhead Carbon Capture Power Station	Decarb Scotland conference, Murrayfield	Meeting is not listed on "Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts", FOI response states "we have no records of meetings having taken place"	Press Story; Freedom of Information request; Ministerial engagements, travel and gifts;

We would like to draw particular attention to the meeting between Gillian Martin MSP, who is responsible for overseeing the Energy Consent process, and SSE. The Lobbying Register shows that Martin met Greg Clarke and Kirstanne Land of SSE at Colpy Business Park,

Oldmeldrum, Aberdeenshire on 15th September 2023.²¹ This shows that the developers for the Peterhead application met with the Minister responsible for the Energy Consents process and yet the Scottish Government took no records of the meeting.

A further four meetings took place between Scottish Government officials and developers. As no Minister was present they do not represent a breach of the Ministerial Code but the absence of records being kept between major companies such as SSE and Equinor and the Scottish Government is a serious concern given that these companies are pursuing a major planning application.

Date	Scottish Government official	Company and lobbyists	Location	Missing records	Source ²²
16/03/2022	John McFarlane (Special Adviser)	SSE: Niall Murphy, Jamie Maxton	Video conference	FOI response states "we have no records of meetings having taken place"	Lobbying Register, Freedom of Information request
14/09/2022	John McFarlane (Special Adviser) and Harry Huyton (Special Adviser)	SSE: Niall Murphy, Greg Clarke, Jamie Maxton	Video conference	FOI response states "we have no records of meetings having taken place"	Lobbying Register, Freedom of Information request
03/11/2022	Liz Lloyd (Special Adviser)	SSE: Alistair Phillips- Davies, Glenn Barber	COP27, Blue Zone, Sharm El- Sheikh None	FOI response states "we have no records of meetings having taken place"	Lobbying Register, Freedom of Information request
05/10/2023	Calum McCaig - Special Adviser	SSE: Niall Murphy, Jamie Maxton, Greg Clarke	Scottish Parliament	FOI response states "we have no records of meetings having taken place"	Lobbying Register, Freedom of Information request

D. Ministers meeting with developers and not objectors

Paragraph 8.3 of the Ministerial Code sets out examples of actions that might be viewed as prejudicial to the planning process. Paragraph 8.3(b) gives a specific example of how Ministers might prejudice the planning process as follows:

Meeting the developer or objectors to discuss the proposal, but not meeting all parties with an interest in the decision. The Planning Minister, or any other Minister involved in the planning decision, should only hold such a meeting if it is possible to meet **all** interested parties in respect of a particular proposal or, as an absolute minimum, to offer all parties the opportunity of such a meeting...

 $\underline{https://www.lobbying.scot/SPS/InformationReturn/SearchInformationReturnDetail/45605?AspxAutoDetectCookieSupport=1}\\$

9

²¹ Lobbying Register entry:

²² Sources are detailed in the accompanying spreadsheet, tab 2

Ministers have breached the Ministerial Code by showing a general pattern of favour towards the developers, meeting repeatedly with them during the planning period whilst neglecting objectors.

The records above show that Ministers were briefed to discuss, or spoke publicly about, the proposed gas fired power station at Peterhead on at least 10 occasions with the developers. These are listed in the previous section.

Furthermore, the sheer quantity of meetings with developers represents a lack of fairness towards objectors. According to Scottish Government records and the Lobbying Register the Scottish Government met with SSE on 50 occasions and Equinor on 11 occasions during the period of 18th February 2022 to 31st December 2023. This represents the Scottish Government meeting with the developers more than once a fortnight at a time when the planning process was live.²³

Five individuals and organisations have submitted objections to the planning application for the new gas power station at Peterhead²⁴ as well as the Scottish Environmental Protection Agency (SEPA). Friends of the Earth Scotland, one of the objectors, have met Scottish Ministers 7 times and Special Advisors 3 times, far less than the 61 occasions in which the Scottish Government met the developers in the same period.²⁵

When representatives of Friends of the Earth Scotland raised the Peterhead power station application during Scottish Government meetings, they were told that Ministers could not discuss it with them.

Objectors have requested opportunities to discuss the application with the Scottish Government and have been repeatedly rebuffed:

- Gillian Martin MSP, Minister for Energy, refused to meet with Friends of the Earth Scotland (8th April 2024) stating that she is "unable to comment on the Peterhead Power Station planning application" as it is "live". ²⁶
- Gillian Martin MSP, Minister for Energy, in a letter dated 16th April 2024 to Shona Robison of Dundee, refused a request for a meeting and states that "it would not be appropriate to comment on a live planning application", whilst going on to explain the Scottish Government's support for the technology proposed at the site.²⁷

We look forward to your response.

Savaledian

Your sincerely,

²³ A list of these meetings, extracted from the Lobbying Register, is provided in the accompanying spreadsheet, tab 1.

https://www.energyconsents.scot/ApplicationDetails.aspx?cr=ECU00003433&T=4

²⁴ Scottish Government energy consents website:

²⁵ A list of these meetings, extracted from the Lobbying Register, is provided in the accompanying spreadsheet, tab 3.

²⁶ Letter from Gillian Martin MSP to Malachy Clarke, 8th April 2024, included in accompanying documents

²⁷ Letter from Gillian Martin MSP to Shona Robison, 16th April 2024, included in accompanying documents

Florence Garabedian Interim CEO, Friends of the Earth Scotland

Caroline Rance

Manager, Fossil Fuel Transition

Ric Lander

Manager, Research and Development

Friends of the Earth Scotland

19 July 2024

Accompanying documents:

- (i) Spreadsheet of meetings including three tabs: all meetings relevant to breaches of the Ministerial Code; meetings where records are missing; FoES meetings with the Scottish Government (for comparison)
- (ii) Letter from Gillian Martin MSP to Malachy Clarke, 8th April 2024
- (iii) Letter from Gillian Martin MSP to Shona Robison, 16th April 2024
- (iv) FOI 1: Meetings between the Scottish Government, SSE and Equinor submitted by Ric Lander (SG ref 202400396587)
- (v) FOI 2: Meetings between the Scottish Government, SSE, Equinor, Ian Wood and True North submitted by Malachy Clarke (SG ref 202400401637)
- (vi) FOI 3: Meetings between the Scottish Government, SSE, NECCUS and Equinor submitted by Ric Lander (SG ref 202400407153)